

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Blakebrough, R. Chapman, D. Dovey, D. Edwards, D. Evans, R. Harris, B. Hayward, J. Higginson, P. Murphy, M. Powell, B. Strong, P. Watts, A. Webb, and A. Wintle

County Councillors: M. Hickman, A. Easson and V. Smith attended the meeting by invitation of the Chairman.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Paula Clarke	Planning Applications and Enforcement Manager
Shirley Wiggam	Senior Strategy & Policy Officer
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

None.

1. Declarations of Interest

County Councillor Ruth Edwards declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DC/2016/00803, as she knew the applicant. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

2. Confirmation of minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 2nd August 2016 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

3. APPLICATION DC/2015/00938 - DEMOLITION OF EXISTING DWELLING AND DETACHED GARAGE. ERECTION OF REPLACEMENT DWELLING AND DETACHED GARAGE. RELOCATION OF EXISTING VEHICULAR ACCESS. ORCHARD HOUSE, LLANBADOC, USK

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Llanbadoc, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- The application is a very different proposal to the previous application. It is a unique and individual scheme with an interesting design.
- However, residents have expressed concern regarding the access to the proposal.
- Traffic along this route is extremely fast.
- One of the speed signs impedes visibility at the proposed new access.
- Concerned regarding safety issues in respect of the new access. It would be safer to retain and improve the existing access.
- If the access remains in its existing position, the development will have less of an impact on nearby properties because the original hedge would be retained.

Mr. P. Williams, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

- He had supported the original application with privacy issues being addressed.
- However, there were objections to the new application, namely:
- Modern design, which exceeds the volume of the existing property by 57%, exceeding the volume increase allowed.
- The proposed development will result in a cube like property which would not be in keeping with the surrounding properties.
- The relocation of the access will not improve the visibility splays with inappropriate site lines being created.

Mr. G. Buckle, representing the applicant, outlined the following points:

- It would be more economical to demolish the existing property and create a new dwelling that would be well insulated and energy efficient.
- The design is contemporary which had been received favourably by officers.
- The new proposal will use modern materials with the roof being insulated to a high standard.
- The height of the property will be reduced by two metres compared to the original property.
- The new access is an improvement on the existing access. It will have greater visibility splays following months of discussion with officers.
- The modern designed property will create low carbon emissions.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- The design of the new proposal will complement the surrounding area.
- A construction environment plan will be provided.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- Concern was expressed regarding the proposed new access and the visibility splay. It was considered that retention of the original access would be a better option.
- The design of the property was good but it would be inappropriate at this site.
- The increase in the size of the proposed dwelling was a concern and was not in keeping with the surrounding properties.

Officers stated that the increase in the size of the proposed new dwelling would not create an adverse impact on the surrounding area.

In summing up, the local Member reiterated that the proposed new dwelling was a unique design. However, the proposed new access was a concern.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor R. Harris and seconded by County Councillor D. Evans that application DC/2015/00938 be approved subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to the issues regarding the proposed new access being addressed.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	4
Against approval	12
Abstentions	0

The proposition was not carried.

We resolved that we be minded to refuse application DC/2015/00938 on the grounds of access, scale, appearance / design and that the application be re-presented to a future Planning Committee meeting with appropriate reasons for refusal.

4. APPLICATION DC/2015/00606 - RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT OF ALLOCATION SITE SAH11 (XII) TO PROVIDE 10 DWELLINGS (INCLUDING 60% AFFORDABLE). LAND TO THE SOUTH WEST OF PENALLT, MONMOUTH, NP25 4SB

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 Agreement.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm

The Planning Committee on 1st December 2015 had resolved to approve the application subject to planning conditions and a legal agreement. The legal agreement has yet to be signed as there is a question regarding the viability of delivering the development, as approved. The financial viability relates to build costs and the logistical implementation of the highways drainage. A revised scheme has now been submitted for consideration today.

The local Member for Trellech, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- Concerned that the quality of affordable housing was being compromised.
- The design of the properties was not in keeping with other properties within the rural setting.
- The size of the affordable houses was a concern, as it was believed that these plots were below the minimal floor area.

The Senior Strategy & Policy Officer informed the Committee that Social Housing Development Quality Requirements (DQR) were being met. The affordable houses were therefore appropriately sized.

The Head of Planning Housing and Place Shaping informed the Committee that the materials being used in the development were of a high quality brick and officers were content with the quality of the new materials.

Some Members supported the local Member and stated that the original application had been approved with larger affordable houses and that the design quality had been reduced.

However, other Members agreed with the officers' recommendation to approve the application and considered that there were no grounds on which the application should be refused.

Having considered the report and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Blakebrough and seconded by County Councillor R. Hayward that application DC/2015/00606 be refused on the grounds of lack of design and quality of the affordable housing.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	2
Against refusal	13
Abstentions	1

The proposition was not carried.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

We resolved:

- (i) that application DC/2015/00606 be approved subject to the 10 conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 Agreement;
- (ii) that officers liaise with the developers requesting that consideration be given to providing overhanging roofs instead of providing flush end roofs, as indicated in the application.

5. APPLICATION DC/2015/01389 - OUTLINE APPLICATION FOR RETAIL DEVELOPMENT AND PUBLIC HOUSE ON LAND WHICH IS CURRENTLY BEING USED AS THE CARPARK FOR THE MITEL BUILDING. CASTLEGATE BUSINESS PARK, CALDICOT

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the nine conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 Agreement requiring a financial contribution towards highway improvements to the local highway network and infrastructure including improvements to pedestrian facilities for safer routes to local amenities.

In noting the detail of the application, the proposal included the erection of a public house, which Members were in favour of, and four small retail units. Caldicot Town Team was experiencing difficulties in filling retail units within the town with a number of retail units currently vacant. Concern was expressed that the creation of additional retail units outside of the town would create a detrimental effect within the town centre development.

It was noted that the four proposed retail units would comprise of a mixture of A1, A2 and A3 uses.

Officers considered that the additional four retail developments would be relatively small and would not affect the development of the town centre.

In considering the detail of the report, it was noted that this was an outline application with all matters reserved for future consideration. Therefore, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Evans and seconded by County Councillor R. Hayward that application DC/2015/01389 be approved subject to the nine conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 Agreement requiring a financial contribution towards highway improvements to the local highway network and infrastructure including improvements to pedestrian facilities for safer routes to local amenities.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	10
Against approval	6
Abstentions	0

The proposition was carried.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm

We resolved that application DC/2015/01389 be approved subject to the nine conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 Agreement requiring a financial contribution towards highway improvements to the local highway network and infrastructure including improvements to pedestrian facilities for safer routes to local amenities.

6. APPLICATION DC/2016/00634 - CHANGE OF USE FROM RESIDENTIAL DWELLING TO PRIVATE DAY CARE NURSERY. TALYBONT COTTAGE, LLANELLEN ROAD, LLANFOIST

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Llanfoist, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points in support of the application:

- The applicant has a proven professional record with regard to providing private day care nurseries.
- The applicant has two other units which are thriving.
- These have a 5* food hygiene rating.
- The applicant has the support of Estyn.
- There is a need for a day care nursery in Monmouthshire.
- Seven full time posts will be generated if the application is approved.
- Opening hours are from 7.00am to 7.00pm. However, operating hours will most likely be between 8.00am and 6.00pm.
- Drop off times will be staggered.
- Children will be taken into and collected from the nursery.
- Supervised play involving small groups of children will occur outside after 9.00am, which will be staggered.
- Noise levels will be minimal.
- The current site is derelict and in need of development.

Having considered the report of the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2016/00634 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

For approval	16
Against approval	0
Abstentions	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00634 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

7. APPLICATION DC/2016/00803 - STABLES FOR FOUR HORSES. RED HOUSE FARM, ROCKFIELD, MONMOUTH

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Having considered the application, the Committee expressed its support. In doing so, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Evans and seconded by County Councillor D. Edwards that application DC/2016/00803 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	15
Against approval	0
Abstentions	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00803 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

8. APPLICATION DC/2016/00804 - ERECTION OF A TWO STOREY, DETACHED HOUSE WITH ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING IN PART OF THE GARDEN. 17 BULWARK AVENUE BULWARK, CHEPSTOW

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, it was considered that an informative should be added regarding the developers' need to ensure that construction hours do not cause harm to the local amenity. Advice could be sought via the County Council's Environmental Health Department.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Hayward that application DC/2016/00804 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th September, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

For approval	16
Against approval	0
Abstentions	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00804 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

The meeting ended at 4.05 pm